

DRAFT Evaluation Scores

System Preservation

The criteria for evaluating applications for new funding commitments are used to measure how well they advance the six goals identified for the MTP.

Through transportation:

- Reduce per capita **energy** consumption and promote alternative fuel resources to increase affordability and resilience of regional energy supplies.
- Protect **natural resources** and mitigate infrastructure vulnerabilities to maintain a healthy ecosystem and community.
- Position Central Ohio to attract and retain **economic opportunity** to prosper as a region and compete globally.
- Create **sustainable neighborhoods** to improve residents' quality of life.
- Increase regional **collaboration** and employ innovative transportation solutions to maximize the return on public expenditures.
- Use public investments to benefit the **health, safety, and welfare** of people

Data for the criteria in each goal was compiled. The overall score for each goal is on a scale of 1 to 10 subjectively based on an overall consideration of the data and qualitative statements with regard to each criterion. Although there is no specific weighting of criteria within each goal, there are three levels of priority among the criteria for each goal (A, B, and C) as shown in the Criteria Tables within the Policies. The score is also established relative to the other applications' information for the goal. If the data associated with a particular goal do not provide a meaningful distinction between two applications, they received the same score for that goal. For minor differences, the scores between two applications will be close to each other. For applications that are clearly separated based on the goal criteria, the applications scores will be significantly different. Included with the goal score is a brief rationale for the score. The System Preservation category is evaluated on the following criteria:

Energy

- Components that Save Energy (B)
- Other Extraordinary Aspects (B)

Natural Resources

- Addressing Sensitive Land Issues (B)
- Water Runoff Quality & Quantity (B)
- Vegetation and Habitat Restoration (B)
- Other Extraordinary Aspects (B)

Economic Opportunity

- Job Retention & Creation (B)
- Traffic Composition (A)
- Other Considerations (C)

Sustainable Neighborhoods

- Origin/Destination Density (A)
- Pedestrian System (B)
- Bikeway System (B)
- Displacements (B)
- On Transit Line (B)
- Transit System (C)
- Other Considerations (B)

Collaboration

- Percent and Amount of MORPC Funding Requested (A)
- Documentation of Support and Collaboration (B)
- Origin of Project/Project Readiness (B)
- Percent and Amount of Private Sector Funding (B)
- Applicant Priority Ranking (C)

- Small Agency Funding Capacity (C)

Health, Safety & Welfare

- Crash Reduction (B)
- Facility Condition (A)
- Environmental Justice (B)
- System Life (C)
- Other Considerations (C)

The following pages provide the DRAFT score (1 to 10) by goal and brief rationale. Staff requests the AFC to review these and provide feedback by December 30. Revised scores will be provided to AFC for review on January 6 in advance of the January 20 AFC Meeting.

The final pages provide the total score in order from highest to lowest. These scores reflect the goal score weighted as established in the Policies (shown below). Also, shown are the scores by goal and rationale for each goal.

| Activity Category | Economy | Natural Resources | Energy | Collaboration | Health, Safety & Welfare | Sustainable Neighborhoods |
|----------------------------|---------|-------------------|--------|---------------|--------------------------|---------------------------|
| System Preservation | 15 | 5 | 10 | 15 | 35 | 20 |

Economic Opportunity Summary - PRELIMINARY DRAFT

System Preservation

| | | Total Score | | |
|---------------|--|-------------|----|------|
| <u>Map ID</u> | <u>Project Title</u> | En | Co | We |
| EO Score | EO_Rationale | | SN | NR |
| <u>302</u> | <u>Downtown Signals, Rich Street Signal Replacements</u> | | | 51.0 |
| 7 | The project is by far highest in the category in terms of existing jobs in the area. No new jobs cited as a result of the project. It is second in terms of the combination of existing ADT, future ADT and truck percentage. In other considerations, project works in conjunction with a number of other initiatives to create a strong downtown for the region. | 1 | 5 | 5 |
| | | | 7 | 1 |
| <u>301</u> | <u>Cleveland Avenue Resurfacing</u> | | | 42.5 |
| 6 | The project is second lowest in the category in terms of existing jobs in the area. No new jobs cited as a result of the project. It is highest in terms of the combination of existing ADT, future ADT and truck percentage. No significant other consideratio | 1 | 2 | 6 |
| | | | 4 | 1 |
| <u>306</u> | <u>Fifth Avenue Signal Replacements, from North Star to High Street</u> | | | 40.0 |
| 4 | The project is second in the category in terms of existing jobs in the area. No new jobs cited as a result of the project. It is lowest in terms of the combination of existing ADT, future ADT and truck percentage. No significant other considerations. | 1 | 2 | 5 |
| | | | 6 | 1 |
| <u>305</u> | <u>Bale-Kenyon Phase 1</u> | | | 37.0 |
| 3 | The project is middle in the category in terms of existing jobs in the area. No new jobs cited as a result of the project. It is middle in terms of the combination of existing ADT, future ADT and truck percentage. No significant other considerations. | 0 | 3 | 5 |
| | | | 5 | 1 |
| <u>303</u> | <u>East Cooke Road Phase 1</u> | | | 46.0 |
| 2 | The project is lowest in the category in terms of existing jobs in the area. No new jobs cited as a result of the project. It is second lowest in terms of the combination of existing ADT, future ADT and truck percentage. No significant other considerations. | 1 | 3 | 7 |
| | | | 6 | 2 |

Collaboration Summary - PRELIMINARY DRAFT

System Preservation

| | | Total Score | | |
|------------|--|-------------|----|-------------|
| Map ID | Project Title | En | EO | We |
| Co Score | Co_Rationale | | SN | NR |
| <u>302</u> | <u>Downtown Signals, Rich Street Signal Replacements</u> | | | 51.0 |
| 5 | Typical matching percentage. Requesting 15% of projected available funds. No funding partners. One support letter from an adjacent property owner and one from a local organization. No studies/plans identified the need. No PDP progress. No private sector funding. Sponsor's top priority in Preservation category. Sponsor is not a small agency. | 1 | 7 | 5 |
| | | | 7 | 1 |
| <u>305</u> | <u>Bale-Kenyon Phase 1</u> | | | 37.0 |
| 3 | Requesting a smaller than typical proportion (less than 70%) of project costs. Smaller amount requested. No funding partners. No support letters. Previous feasibility studies were referenced. No PDP progress. No private sector funding. Sponsor's top priority in Preservation category. Sponsor is not a small agency. | 0 | 3 | 5 |
| | | | 5 | 1 |
| <u>303</u> | <u>East Cooke Road Phase 1</u> | | | 46.0 |
| 3 | Typical matching percentage. Moderate amount requested. No funding partners. Support letters from two local agencies. No studies/plans identified the need. No PDP progress. No private sector funding. Sponsor's top priority in Preservation category. Sponsor is not a small agency. | 1 | 2 | 7 |
| | | | 6 | 2 |
| <u>301</u> | <u>Cleveland Avenue Resurfacing</u> | | | 42.5 |
| 2 | Typical matching percentage. Smaller amount requested. No funding partners. One support letter from a local agency. Need identified by the sponsor's pavement management system. No PDP progress. No private sector funding. Not the sponsor's top priority in Preservation category. Sponsor is not a small agency. | 1 | 6 | 6 |
| | | | 4 | 1 |
| <u>306</u> | <u>Fifth Avenue Signal Replacements, from North Star to High Street</u> | | | 40.0 |
| 2 | Typical matching percentage. Moderate amount requested. No funding partners. One support letter from a local agency. Need identified by the sponsor's inspection process. No PDP progress. No private sector funding. Not the sponsor's top priority in Preservation category. Sponsor is not a small agency. | 1 | 4 | 5 |
| | | | 6 | 1 |

Energy Summary - PRELIMINARY DRAFT

System Preservation

| | | Total Score | | |
|---------------|---|-------------|----|-------------|
| <u>Map ID</u> | <u>Project Title</u> | Co | EO | We |
| En Score | En_Rationale | SN | NR | |
| <u>301</u> | <u>Cleveland Avenue Resurfacing</u> | | | 42.5 |
| 1 | May use reclaimed asphalt to provide some energy saving are proposed as part of this improvement. | 2 | 6 | 6 |
| | | | 4 | 1 |
| <u>306</u> | <u>Fifth Avenue Signal Replacements, from North Star to High Street</u> | | | 40.0 |
| 1 | It is stated that LED signal heads will be implemented. | 2 | 4 | 5 |
| | | | 6 | 1 |
| <u>303</u> | <u>East Cooke Road Phase 1</u> | | | 46.0 |
| 1 | It is stated that LED street lights will be implemented as needed. | 3 | 2 | 7 |
| | | | 6 | 2 |
| <u>302</u> | <u>Downtown Signals, Rich Street Signal Replacements</u> | | | 51.0 |
| 1 | It is stated that LED signal heads will be implemented. | 5 | 7 | 5 |
| | | | 7 | 1 |
| <u>305</u> | <u>Bale-Kenyon Phase 1</u> | | | 37.0 |
| 0 | No energy saving components are proposed as part of this improvement. | 3 | 3 | 5 |
| | | | 5 | 1 |

Natural Resources Summary - PRELIMINARY DRAFT

System Preservation

| | | Total Score | | |
|---------------|---|-------------|----|-------------|
| <u>Map ID</u> | <u>Project Title</u> | En | Co | EO |
| NR Score | NR_Rationale | SN | We | |
| <u>303</u> | <u>East Cooke Road Phase 1</u> | | | 46.0 |
| 2 | This project does not have a significant positive or negative impact on natural resources, although water runoff/stormwater systems will be improved. | 1 | 3 | 2 |
| | | | 6 | 7 |
| <u>301</u> | <u>Cleveland Avenue Resurfacing</u> | | | 42.5 |
| 1 | This project does not have a significant positive or negative impact on natural resources. | 1 | 2 | 6 |
| | | | 4 | 6 |
| <u>302</u> | <u>Downtown Signals, Rich Street Signal Replacements</u> | | | 51.0 |
| 1 | This project does not have a significant positive or negative impact on natural resources. | 1 | 5 | 7 |
| | | | 7 | 5 |
| <u>305</u> | <u>Bale-Kenyon Phase 1</u> | | | 37.0 |
| 1 | This project does not have a significant positive or negative impact on natural resources. | 0 | 3 | 3 |
| | | | 5 | 5 |
| <u>306</u> | <u>Fifth Avenue Signal Replacements, from North Star to High Street</u> | | | 40.0 |
| 1 | This project does not have a significant positive or negative impact on natural resources. | 1 | 2 | 4 |
| | | | 6 | 5 |

Sustainable Neighborhoods Summary-PRELIMINARY DRAFT

System Preservation

| | | Total Score | | |
|------------|---|-------------|----|-------------|
| Map ID | Project Title | En | Co | We |
| SN Score | SN_Rationale | EO | NR | |
| <u>302</u> | <u>Downtown Signals, Rich Street Signal Replacements</u> | | | 51.0 |
| 7 | This projects origin/destination density is by far the highest for this category. This project will improve existing pedestrian facilities through inclusion of new ADA pedestrian signal heads and pushbuttons. No new bike facilities are included in the scope of this project. A transit line exists along the project corridor. | 1 | 5 | 5 |
| | | | 7 | 1 |
| <u>306</u> | <u>Fifth Avenue Signal Replacements, from North Star to High Street</u> | | | 40.0 |
| 6 | This projects origin/destination density is above the median for this category. Existing pedestrian facilities will be rehabilitated as part of this project. No new bike facilities are included in the scope of this project. Multiple transit lines and stops are supported by this project. | 1 | 2 | 5 |
| | | | 4 | 1 |
| <u>303</u> | <u>East Cooke Road Phase 1</u> | | | 46.0 |
| 6 | This projects origin/destination density is the median for this category. This project will rehabilitate the existing sidewalk, and construct a new MUP along the project corridor which will connect to existing bike and pedestrian facilities. No transit lines utilize the project corridor, but this project will improve first/last mile connections to nearby transit stops. | 1 | 3 | 7 |
| | | | 2 | 2 |
| <u>305</u> | <u>Bale-Kenyon Phase 1</u> | | | 37.0 |
| 5 | This projects origin/destination density is below the median for this category., This project will construct a MUP where no current bike or pedestrian facilities exist. No transit lines are supported by this project. | 0 | 3 | 5 |
| | | | 3 | 1 |
| <u>301</u> | <u>Cleveland Avenue Resurfacing</u> | | | 42.5 |
| 4 | This projects origin/destination density is below the median for this category. The scope of the project does not include any improvements to pedestrian or bike facilities. This project supports multiple transit lines, including CMAX. | 1 | 2 | 6 |
| | | | 6 | 1 |

Health Safety and Welfare Summary - PRELIMINARY DRAFT

System Preservation

| | | Total Score | | |
|---------------|---|-------------|----|-------------|
| <u>Map ID</u> | <u>Project Title</u> | En | Co | EO |
| We Score | We_Rationale | SN | NR | |
| <u>303</u> | <u>East Cooke Road Phase 1</u> | | | 46.0 |
| 7 | This project has the highest potential to improve facility condition in this category. This project has high crash numbers for this category, and this project includes bike and pedestrian facilities which have potential to reduce crashes. Project serves environmental justice populations second highest of the category and significantly higher proportion than the regional average. | 1 | 3 | 2 |
| | | | 6 | 2 |
| <u>301</u> | <u>Cleveland Avenue Resurfacing</u> | | | 42.5 |
| 6 | The existing facility condition for this project is above the median for this category. This project has high crash numbers for this category, though it is uncertain if this project will have significantly improve safety. Project serves environmental justice populations highest of the category and significantly higher proportion than the regional average. | 1 | 2 | 6 |
| | | | 4 | 1 |
| <u>306</u> | <u>Fifth Avenue Signal Replacements, from North Star to High Street</u> | | | 40.0 |
| 5 | This is a signals replacement project, and no improvements to existing pavement conditions are included in the project scope. This project will improve the condition of existing signals, which are currently rated in poor condition. The crash numbers for this project are the lowest for this category. Project serves environmental justice populations in the low range of the category. | 1 | 2 | 4 |
| | | | 6 | 1 |
| <u>305</u> | <u>Bale-Kenyon Phase 1</u> | | | 37.0 |
| 5 | The existing facility condition for this project is above the median for this category. This project has crash numbers near the median for this category, and this project has the potential to improve safety. Project serves environmental justice populations in the low range of the category. | 0 | 3 | 3 |
| | | | 5 | 1 |
| <u>302</u> | <u>Downtown Signals, Rich Street Signal Replacements</u> | | | 51.0 |
| 5 | This is a signals replacement project, and no improvements to existing pavement conditions are included in the project scope. This project will improve the condition of existing signals. The crash numbers are the median for this category, and the project has some potential to improve safety. Project serves environmental justice populations in the middle of the category. | 1 | 5 | 7 |
| | | | 7 | 1 |